

**IN THE APPELLATE TRIBUNAL FOR ELECTRICITY  
AT NEW DELHI  
(APPELLATE JURISDICTION)**

**[ADANI GROUP]**

**APPEAL NO.100 OF 2013 & I.A. No.116 OF 2013; APPEAL  
NO.98 OF 2014 & I.A. NO.343 & 402 OF 2014; APPEAL NO. 116  
OF 2014; APPEAL NO. 125 OF 2014 & I.A. NO.211 OF 2014 &  
APPEAL NO. 134 OF 2014**

ALONG WITH

**[CGPL GROUP]**

**APPEAL NO.151 OF 2013 & I.A. NO.220 OF 2013 & I.A. NO.412  
OF 2014 & APPEAL NO.97 OF 2014; APPEAL NO. 91 OF 2014;  
APPEAL NO.100 OF 2014; APPEAL NO.115 OF 2014; APPEAL  
NO.124 OF 2014; APPEAL NO.133 OF 2014 & I.A. NO.234 OF  
2014 & APPEAL NO.139 OF 2014 & I.A. No. 238 OF 2014**

ALONG WITH

**[GMR GROUP]**

**APPEAL NO.44 OF 2014 & I.A. NO.65 OF 2014; APPEAL NO.74  
OF 2014 & I.A. NO.143 OF 2014**

ALONG WITH

**[SASAN GROUP]**

**APPEAL NO.99 OF 2014; APPEAL NO.104 OF 2014**

Uttar Haryana Bijli Vitran Nigam Ltd. )  
& Anr. (Jointly through Haryana )  
Power Purchase Centre), etc. ) .... Appellants

Vs.

Central Electricity Regulatory )  
Commission & Ors., etc. ) .... Respondents

**I N D E X**  
**PART – I**  
**FACTS OF APPEALS**

S.No.	Topic	Page No.
I.	Description of parties and appearances.	1 – 31
II.	Facts leading to Constitution of Full Bench.	32 – 34
III.	<b><u>FACTS LEADING TO APPEALS RELATING TO ADANI GROUP:</u></b>	35 – 56

	[A]	Description of Parties in Appeal No.100 of 2013.	35 – 36
	[B]	Brief facts of Appeal No.100 of 2013.	36 – 37
	[C]	PPA dated 02/02/2007 with GUVNL.	37 – 42
	[D]	PPAs dated 07/08/2008 with Haryana Utilities.	42 – 46
	[E]	Events leading to institution of Petition No.155/MP/2012 and Relief sought therein.	46 – 50
	[F]	Summary of Central Commission's Interim Order dated 16/10/2012 on the preliminary issue of jurisdiction.	50
	[G]	Summary of Central Commission's Order dated 02/04/2013 rejecting the claim of Force Majeure and Change in Law and constituting an Expert Committee to look into the alleged difficulties faced by Adani Power and find an acceptable solution.	50 – 51
	[H]	Institution of Appeal No.100 of 2013.	51
	[I]	Constitution of Expert Committee and its Reports.	51 – 53
	[J]	Summary of Central Commission's Final Order dated 21/02/2014 granting compensatory tariff to Adani Power.	53 – 54
	[K]	Details of appeals filed by various Utilities and Consumer Organizations in Adani Group challenging the Final Order dated 21/02/2014.	54
	[L]	Adani Power's Cross-Objections and its Rejection by this Tribunal.	55 – 56
IV.	<b><u>FACTS LEADING TO APPEALS RELATING TO CGPL GROUP:</u></b>		56 – 70
	[A]	Description of Parties in Appeal No.151 OF 2013.	56 – 57
	[B]	Brief facts of Appeal No.151 of 2013.	57
	[C]	Events leading to institution of Petition No.159/MP/2012 and the Relief sought.	58 – 66
	[D]	Summary of Central Commission's Interim Order dated 15/04/2013 rejecting the claim of Force Majeure and Change in Law and by invoking Section 79(1)(b) of the said Act constituting an Expert Committee for suggesting the compensatory tariff which would be payable to CGPL.	66 – 67
	[E]	Institution of Appeal No.151 of 2013.	67
	[F]	Summary of Central Commission's Final Order dated 21/02/2014 granting compensatory tariff to CGPL.	67 – 68
	[G]	Details of Appeals filed by various Utilities and Consumer Organizations in CGPL Group challenging the Final Order dated 21/02/2014.	68 – 69

	[H]	CGPL's appeal challenging rejection of its claim of Force Majeure and Change in Law by this Tribunal due to delay in filing and subsequent events.	69 – 70
V.	<b><u>FACTS LEADING TO APPEALS RELATING TO GMR GROUP.</u></b>		70 – 78
	[A]	Description of Parties in Appeal No.44 of 2014.	70 – 71
	[B]	Brief facts of Appeal No.44 of 2014.	71 – 77
	[C]	Summary of Central Commission's Interim Orders dated 16/12/2013 and 03/01/2014 deciding the preliminary issues of jurisdiction and maintainability.	77 – 78
	[D]	Details of appeals filed by various Utilities in GMR Group challenging the interim orders.	78
VI.	<b><u>FACTS LEADING TO APPEALS RELATING TO SASAN GROUP.</u></b>		78 – 82
	[A]	Description of Parties in Appeal No.99 of 2014.	78 – 79
	[B]	Brief facts of Appeal No.99 of 2014.	79 – 81
	[C]	Summary of Central Commission's Interim Order dated 21/02/2014 which while holding that the claim of Force Majeure is not admissible, proceeded to grant relief in exercise of its regulatory power under Section 79 of the said Act.	81 – 82
	[D]	Details of appeals filed by various Utilities in SASAN Group.	82
VII.	<b><u>AGREED ISSUES FOR CONSIDERATION.</u></b>		82 – 88

## **PART – II**

### **PRELIMINARY ISSUES**

S.No.	Topic	Page No.
VIII.	<b>PRELIMINARY ISSUE REGARDING SCOPE AND EXTENT OF THE SUPREME COURT'S ORDER DATED 31/03/2015 IN CIVIL APPEAL NO.10016 OF 2014.</b>	<b>89 – 99</b>
IX.	<b>FACTS LEADING TO THE ISSUE REGARDING SCOPE AND EXTENT OF THE SUPREME COURT'S ORDER DATED 31/03/2015 IN CIVIL APPEAL NO.10016 OF 2014.</b>	<b>89 – 94</b>
	[A] Submissions of Prayas on the issue regarding scope and extent of the Supreme Court's Order dated 31/03/2015 in Civil Appeal No.10016 of 2014.	94 – 95

	[B]	Analysis and conclusion of the Tribunal on the issue regarding scope and extent of the Supreme Court's Order dated 31/03/2015 in Civil Appeal No.10016 of 2014.	95 - 98
	[C]	Answer to Issue No.1 of Agreed Issues.	98 – 99
X.		<b>PRELIMINARY ISSUE ON CGPL'S CLAIM REGARDING ITS ENTITLEMENT TO RAISE <i>FORCE MAJEURE</i> OR CHANGE IN LAW GROUNDS TO SUPPORT THE COMPENSATORY TARIFF GRANTED BY ORDER DATED 21/2/2014 CLAIMING PARITY WITH THE SUPREME COURT'S ORDER DATED 31/3/2015.</b>	<b>99 – 122</b>
XI.		<b>FACTS LEADING TO THE CGPL'S CLAIM REGARDING ITS ENTITLEMENT TO RAISE <i>FORCE MAJEURE</i> OR CHANGE IN LAW GROUNDS TO SUPPORT THE COMPENSATORY TARIFF GRANTED BY ORDER DATED 21/2/2014 CLAIMING PARITY WITH THE SUPREME COURT'S ORDER DATED 31/3/2015.</b>	<b>100 – 102</b>
	[A]	Submissions of CGPL regarding its entitlement to raise <i>Force Majeure</i> or Change in Law grounds to support the compensatory tariff granted by Order dated 21/2/2014 claiming parity with the Supreme Court's Order dated 31/03/2015.	102 – 100
	[B]	Submissions of Prayas on CGPL's claim regarding its entitlement to raise <i>Force Majeure</i> or Change in Law grounds to support the compensatory tariff granted by Order dated 21/2/2014 claiming parity with the Supreme Court's Order dated 31/03/2015.	110 – 113
	[C]	Submissions of Rajasthan, Gujarat, Punjab, Haryana and Maharashtra Utilities on CGPL's claim regarding its entitlement to raise <i>Force Majeure</i> or Change in Law grounds to support the compensatory tariff granted by Order dated 21/2/2014 claiming parity with the Supreme Court's Order dated 31/03/2015.	113 – 115
	[D]	Analysis and conclusion of the Tribunal on CGPL's claim regarding its entitlement to raise <i>Force Majeure</i> or Change in Law grounds to support the compensatory tariff granted by Order dated 21/2/2014 claiming parity with the Supreme Court's Order dated 31/03/2015.	116 – 121
	[E]	Answer to Issue No.2 of the Agreed Issues.	121 – 122
XII.		<b>PRELIMINARY ISSUE AS TO WHETHER AN INTERIM ORDER CAN BE CHALLENGED ALONG WITH THE FINAL ORDER.</b>	<b>122 – 127</b>

	[A]	Analysis and conclusion of the Tribunal on the issue as to whether an interim order can be challenged along with the Final Order.	122 - 127
	[B]	Answer to the preliminary issue as to whether an Interim Order can be challenged along with the Final Order.	127

**PART – III**

**COMPOSITE SCHEME**

S.No.	Topic		Page No.
XIII.	<b>AGREED ISSUE SUBMITTED BY PARTIES ON COMPOSITE SCHEME UNDER SECTION 79(1)(b) TO ATTRACT THE JURISDICTION OF THE CENTRAL COMMISSION.</b>		<b>128 – 129</b>
	[A]	Summary of Central Commission's Order dated 16/10/2012 on Composite Scheme.	129 – 133
	[B]	Submissions of Prayas on Composite Scheme.	133 – 142
	[C]	Submissions of GRIDCO on Composite Scheme.	142 – 148
	[D]	Submissions of Haryana Utilities in GMR Group on Composite Scheme.	148 – 152
	[E]	Submissions of Haryana Utilities in Adani Group on Composite Scheme.	152 – 155
	[F]	Submissions of Central Commission in Adani Group on Composite Scheme.	155 – 166
	[G]	Submissions of Central Commission in GMR Group on Composite Scheme.	166 – 169
	[H]	Submissions of Adani Power on Composite Scheme.	170 – 178
	[I]	Analysis and conclusion of the Tribunal on Composite Scheme.	178 – 212
	[J]	Answer to Issue No.3 of the Agreed Issues.	212 – 213
XIV	<b><u>AGREED ISSUE SUBMITTED BY PARTIES ON COMPOSITE SCHEME UNDER SECTION 79(1)(b) TO ATTRACT THE JURISDICTION OF THE CENTRAL COMMISSION IN THE CASE OF ADANI POWER AND GMR.</u></b>		<b>213 – 214</b>
	[A]	Answer to Issue No.4 of the Agreed Issues.	214

**PART – IV****REGULATORY POWER & GRANT OF COMPENSATORY TARIFF**

<b>S.No.</b>	<b>Topic</b>	<b>Page No.</b>
XV	<b>AGREED ISSUES SUBMITTED BY PARTIES ON REGULATORY POWER AND GRANT OF COMPENSATORY TARIFF.</b>	<b>215 – 216</b>
	[A] Summary of Central Commission's view on Regulatory Power and grant of compensatory tariff.	216 – 218
	[B] Submissions of Prayas on Regulatory Power and grant of compensatory tariff.	218 – 229
	[C] Presentation on Key Issues by Ms. Chitnis representative of Prayas.	230
	[D] Submissions of Energy Watchdog on Regulatory Power and grant of compensatory tariff.	230 – 233
	[E] Submissions of Rajasthan Utilities on Regulatory Power and grant of compensatory tariff.	233 – 235
	[F] Submissions of Central Commission on Regulatory Power and grant of compensatory tariff.	235 – 240
	[G] Submissions of Adani Power on Regulatory Power and grant of compensatory tariff.	240 – 266
	[H] Submissions of CGPL on Regulatory Power and grant of compensatory tariff.	266 – 269
	[I] Analysis and conclusion of this Tribunal on the issues relating to Regulatory Power and grant of compensatory tariff.	269 – 308
	[J] Answers to Issue Nos.5, 6, 7, 8 and 9 of the Agreed Issues.	308 – 309

**PART – V****CHANGE IN LAW**

<b>S.No.</b>	<b>Topic</b>	<b>Page No.</b>
XVI	<b>AGREED ISSUES SUBMITTED BY PARTIES ON CHANGE IN LAW.</b>	<b>310</b>
	[A] Summary of Central Commission's view on Change in Law.	310 – 311
	[B] Submissions of Prayas on Change in Law.	311 – 316
	[C] Submissions of Punjab Utilities on Change in Law.	317
	[D] Submissions of Rajasthan Utilities on Change in Law.	318 – 320
	[E] Submissions of Adani Power on Change in Law.	321 – 329

	[F]	Submissions of CGPL on Change in Law.	329 – 333
	[G]	Analysis and conclusion of this Tribunal on Change in Law.	333 – 348
	[H]	Answers to Issue Nos.10 and 11 of the Agreed Issues.	349

**PART – VI**

**FORCE MAJEURE**

<b>S.No.</b>	<b>Topic</b>		<b>Page No.</b>
XVII	<b>AGREED ISSUES SUBMITTED BY PARTIES ON FORCE MAJEURE.</b>		<b>350 – 351</b>
	[A]	Summary of Central Commission's Order dated 2/4/2013 on Force Majeure in Adani Group.	351 – 355
	[B]	Summary of Central Commission's Order dated 15/4/2013 on Force Majeure in CGPL Group.	355 – 358
	[C]	Submissions of Prayas on Force Majeure.	358 – 364
	[D]	Submissions of Punjab Utilities on Force Majeure.	364
	[E]	Submissions of Adani Power on Force Majeure.	365 – 379
	[F]	Submissions of CGPL on Force Majeure.	379 – 382
	[G]	Facts surrounding PPA dated 2/2/2007 between Adani Power and GUVNL.	382 – 392
	[H]	Facts surrounding PPAs dated 7/8/2008 between Adani Power and Haryana Utilities.	392 – 402
	[I]	Facts surrounding PPA dated 22/04/2007 between CGPL and procurers of Gujarat, Maharashtra, Punjab, Haryana and Rajasthan.	402 – 417
	[J]	Analysis and conclusion of this Tribunal on Force Majeure.	417 – 467
	[K]	Answers to Issue Nos.12, 13, 14 and 15 of the Agreed Issues.	467 – 468
		<b>ISSUES &amp; ANSWERS</b>	<b>469 – 480</b>
	[L]	Decision on Adani Power and CGPL Group Appeals.	480 – 482
	[M]	Decision on GMR Group Appeals.	482 – 484
	[N]	Decision on Sasan Group Appeals.	484 – 486